



**7th Public Health Planning in Hearing Impairment Course
2021 Islamabad Pakistan**

Photo courtesy – Shafaq Bajwa – PIRS - 2021

LONDON SCHOOL of HYGIENE & TROPICAL MEDICINE



International Centre for Evidence in Disability



Table of contents	1
Message from Executive Director	2
Executive summary	3
Part 1	4-7
Background of PHPHI courses from 2015 – 2020	4
Pre-course preparations	4
The course 6 th – 9 th	5
Presentations and Q&As sessions	6
Learning and outcome	7
Recommendations	7
Part 2	
Annexures	
Annex 1	8
Course organizer teams	
Annex 2	8
Topics for group work and presentations	
Annex 3	9
List of participants	
Annex 4	10-13
Programme Online PHPHI course 2020 Islamabad	

Message from Executive Director

I am pleased to present the Report on 7th Public Health Planning for Hearing Impairment (PHPHI) 2021 Islamabad course conducted online by Pakistan Institute of Rehabilitation Sciences (PIRS) in collaboration with International Centre for Evidence in Disability (ICED), London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine (LSHTM).

Pakistan Institute of Rehabilitation Sciences recognises the importance of public health in combating hearing impairment and rehabilitation. Planning is an integral part of public health and with the changing world where there is more emphasis on curative than prevention, lack of awareness about hearing impairment, lack of political commitment and quality data, there is a dire need to tackle hearing impairment from the public health perspective.

Since 2020, the prevalent COVID-19 pandemic and travel restrictions in many countries, it was decided to conduct a hybrid PHPHI 2021 course where international faculty joined from London/UK, Liverpool/UK, Wales/UK, WHO Geneva/Switzerland, Sydney/Australia, Nairobi/Kenya, and Tenerife/Spain while host faculty joined from PIRS. Participants also joined online via Zoom from Rawalpindi, Islamabad, Attock, Sargodha, Karachi, and Sibbi/Baluchistan.

This Report highlights various aspects of PHPHI courses including online course conduction, presentations, discussion sessions, key learning outcomes, reading materials and projects developed by working groups during the course.

Pakistan Institute of Rehabilitation Sciences sincerely acknowledges CHEF International, CBM International, International Centre for Evidence in Disability, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, World Health Organization, and participants for their contributions.

Maj Gen I Farrukh Seir

Executive Director

Pakistan Institute of Rehabilitation Sciences

Executive Summary

The first ever World Report on Hearing was launched on 3rd March 2021 on World Hearing Day. This report states that globally, nearly 450 million people live with disabling hearing loss. When un-addressed, hearing loss has huge impact on those affected and is the cause of significant financial losses. The World Report on Hearing states that it is possible to both prevent and address hearing loss through cost-effective public health interventions.

It became evident to look the hearing impairment from the public health perspective because the number of hearing impairment is growing each day due to changing lifestyles, recreational noise, occupational noise, lack of ear and hearing services, more emphasis on curative than prevention etc.

It was/is also observed that most clinicians and allied clinical workers are not trained in public health approaches specially planning according to the country/area specific needs for hearing impairment.

CBM international planned annual courses in public health planning for hearing impairment. Prof. Andrew Smith from London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine (LSHTM) was assigned to conduct a 5-day annual course in Islamabad – Pakistan. Six courses have been conducted from 2015 – 2020. These courses were attended by a wide variety of audience, who not only learnt public health planning skill but also became a source of continued support to the cause of hearing impairment prevention.

Prof. Andrew Smith, key facilitator of the course addressed major dimensions of public health in this 4-day course including global magnitude of hearing loss, principles of programme planning, situation analysis, primary ear and hearing care, global programmes, health systems, study designs, survey methodology, principles of screening, monitoring and evaluation, barriers to uptake/use of hearing aids and creating awareness.

7th PHPHI Islamabad course was attended by participants from Rawalpindi, Islamabad, Karachi, Sibbi, Attock and Sargodha including trainee audiologists, ENT doctors and public health specialists.

Part 1

The course at a glance

Presentations and Q&As sessions

Course started on 6th December, with the welcome note from Dr Farrukh Seir, Executive Director PIRS. Presentations started with a recorded presentation from Prof Andrew Smith on the introduction of the course, learning objectives and teaching and learning methods, followed by definition and magnitude of hearing loss. Participants calculated prevalence rates and numbers in an exercise. Principles of public health applied to hearing impairment was next recorded presentation that gave an insight into the course through the week. Later in the afternoon after lunch break, Andrew Smith joined live from London and practical exercise and discussion was carried out. Dr Ian Makenzie introduced exercise on raising awareness about hearing loss and asked participants to use ear plugs and feel “hearing impaired” for at least 30 minutes while being with their families or friends.

After recap, second day (Tuesday 7th December) of PHPHI course started with the primary ear and hearing care philosophy and history. Presentation on Global programmes were very well taken by the audience. Dr Manzoor Ahmed, an ENT specialist from district Sargodha who attended the course in 2019, shared his experience from his community field work in D I Khan and highlighted the change in his clinical to public health approach after the PHPHI course. His talk was very much appreciated as he raised an important problem of disability and vulnerability.

Dr Diego Santana, Senior global advisor CBM on ear and hearing health, discussed training resources for primary, secondary, and tertiary levels. He also talked about the evolution of “Oye Bolivia” (Hear Bolivia) project that started as a primary ear and hearing care facility and within the span of 9 years, developed into a tertiary training centre and a state programme for ear and hearing care. Dr Aliya, the host faculty introduced Advocacy for EHC. Later in the afternoon, Sian Tesni, Advisor CBM on special education for deaf and hard of hearing children, presented aspects of special education for deaf and hard of hearing children. Dr Ian Makenzie discussed the outcome of raising awareness exercise. Day 2 concluded with group work on assigned projects in the virtual meeting rooms.

Third day of course, 8th December, remained very interactive and participative, as it started with an overview of study designs and monitoring and evaluation. Dr Ian Makenzie presented his research work on consanguinity and hearing loss and noise induced hearing loss.

A live session on WHO programmes on prevention of hearing loss and world hearing report followed in the afternoon. Dr Shelly Chadha, technical officer WHO, joined from Geneva, Prof Smith and participants had a very constructive discussion about the role of WHO and questions/answers. A short video titled “Hidden Disability” focusing on the early detection, screening, and rehabilitation of hearing impaired. It also highlighted the social inclusion of persons with disabilities. Dr Robin Youngs presented his work on otitis media in Nepal and Myanmar. Dr Sajjad Ahmed from Shifa International Hospital Islamabad shared his view on the outreach activities in EHC.

Fourth and last day, 9th December, of the course started with a presentation on WHO principles of screening by Ms Serah Ndegwa from University of Nairobi, Kenya. Dr Tess Bright from LSHTM shared her PhD research on Rapid Assessment of Hearing Loss (RAHL) methodology. Participants found it particularly useful to determine prevalence of hearing loss in their respective communities. Dr John Newall from Melbourne/Australia joined live and talked about Dementia associated hearing loss. He also shared his experiences of tele-audiology and tele-rehabilitation. His presentation is evidence that tele-medicine is the future in the current covid-19 situation. Prof Smith presented monitoring and evaluation and budgeting, and barriers to hearing aids.

Presentations from participants groups started in the afternoon. Prof Smith, Dr Diego, and Dr Ian Mackenzie reviewed presentations and provided very valuable suggestions and comments. Joana Jeremy from LSHTM introduced the DEAPH group. 7th PPHI course ended with a concluding thank you note.

Discussion sessions

Discussions has always been proved as a way of broadening the scope of any presentation/theory. During the course, Question and answer sessions followed by discussions were very well taken.

WHO session with Shelly Chadha was extremely useful, not only about the WHO programme on prevention of hearing loss but also provided an insight into technical and advisory role of WHO. Participants showed much interest and enthusiasm in “global efforts for hearing and ear care”. Participants query about WHO programmes, its presence at country level, how participants can contribute to these programmes, WHO programmes and projects at country level etc.

Ear and hearing care, Bolivia project was also discussed in detail and evolution of project from a small primary hearing care set up to a tertiary care training centre in 9 years showed a practical example of a project cycle and ongoing process of learning and monitoring. Discussion on this project also provided an opportunity to think about primary health/ear and hearing care as the first step (followed by presentation on key intervention – primary ear and hearing care) and developing training resources as training tool. Primary ear and hearing training resources were taken positively and practically. It was discussed to have translations and divide training resources into smaller parts for easy understanding and use of local primary health workers.

It was observed that participants want more details and discussion RAHL and study designs section. Study designs are considered as an important part of designing projects and specially students showed great interest. Studies with respective study designs for discussions would help in developing more interest and clear understanding of the subject during future courses. Inclusion of Qualitative tools and techniques would also be useful in future.

Learning and outcomes

This second hybrid course via zoom proved a good learning experience for PIRS as an institute and for IT department to identify its strength and weaknesses in term of connectivity, competence, and delivery. Hybrid course is accepted as the “new normal” all over the world now.

A noticeable knowledge retention was observed in the online course. Participant’s involvement in online course was also observed. There were less distractions for participants (coming to venue in the morning, traffic, away from work, going back.....) which helped in deeper involvement in the course because the knowledge imparted during a particular day remained with them and practical exercises, videos, discussions, and encouragement shared with family and other course participants makes it more interesting for them (WhatsApp groups). Participants were able to join from other cities easily (Karachi, Sibbi, Sargodha and Attock) which makes online course accessible and affordable costs.

Another key learning during the course was participants interest in “practical approach and projects”. For example, the story of little Luchiano was well received, especially its connection with poor resource background/marginalized groups, primary ear/health care and as a success case study of early detection and rehabilitation. Another example was “Bolivia project” that was taken as a practical extension/implication of the theoretical presentations. Awareness exercise for hearing loss that some participants practiced with their family members was successful in raising awareness and perceptions of those with hearing loss.

Recommendations

- PHPHI course should be advertised at least 3 months before commencement to receive appropriate and relevant participants.
- Local presenters be informed to submit their presentations at least 15 days before the starting date of the course.
- Organizations nominating their representative participants be encouraged to register a week before starting date of the course.
- As an impact of PHPHI courses, past participants and their work is recommended to be highlighted in future courses.
- PHPHI course be recognized as continued medical education (CME) and credited.
- It is strongly recommended to use PHPHI course as a forum for advocacy for establishing a national vision and strategy for ear and hearing care.

Part 2

Annexures

Annex 1

Course organizer teams

Organizing team LSHTM – Prof Andrew Smith and Joana Jeremy

Organizing team PIRS – Dr Aliya Q Khan, Muhammad Waqas/IT and Usman Ahmed/Finance department

Course facilitator – Prof Andrew Smith – LSHTM

Host faculty – Dr Aliya Q Khan

International faculty – Dr Shelly Chadha – Technical officer for Ear and Hearing Health WHO-Geneva/Switzerland, Dr Diego Santana – Senior global advisor on Ear and Hearing Health CBM Tenerife/Spain, Ms Sian Tesni – Wales/UK, Dr John Newall – Sydney/Australia, Dr Ian Mackenzie – Manchester/UK, Ms Serah Ndegwa University of Nairobi/Kenya and Ms Joana Jeremy – LSHTM/London/UK

Annex 2

Topics for group work projects and presentations

1. Screening for hearing level in soldiers exposed to heavy guns
2. Awareness for communication with hearing impaired
3. Rapid assessment of hearing impaired in I-9 sector Islamabad

Annex 3

List of participants of 7th Online PHPHI course 2021 Islamabad

No.	Name	Affiliation/designation
1	Dr Manzoor Ahmed	ENT Specialist – Sargodha
2	Dr Tariq	ENT Specialist – Sibbi – Baluchistan
3	Dr Usman	ENT Specialist – Attock
4	Dr Omama Shahid	Consultant Audiologist – Rawalpindi
5	Dr Rozina	Medical Officer – HDF – Karachi
6	Dr Robina Shaheen	Public Health Specialist – HDF – Islamabad
7	Sara Ali Khan	Research Coordinator – Islamabad
8	Abdul Karim	Final semester trainee audiologist – PIRS
9	Aysha Riaz	Final semester trainee audiologist – PIRS
10	Fatima Shahid	Final semester trainee audiologist – PIRS
11	Akhtar Farid	Final semester trainee audiologist – PIRS
12	Mahnoor Javed	Final semester trainee audiologist – PIRS
13	Muhammad Farhan	Final semester trainee audiologist – PIRS
14	Mubashir Azhar	Final semester trainee audiologist – PIRS
15	Muhammad Arsalan	Final semester trainee audiologist – PIRS
16	Nabiha Shaheen	Final semester trainee audiologist – PIRS
17	Ramisha Maryam	Final semester trainee audiologist – PIRS
18	Sajjad Hussein	Final semester trainee audiologist – PIRS
19	Samia Naim	Final semester trainee audiologist – PIRS
20	Sania Batool	Final semester trainee audiologist – PIRS
21	Zoya Wali	Final semester trainee audiologist – PIRS
22	Sandal	Final semester trainee audiologist – PIRS
23	Muhammad Ayaz	Final semester trainee audiologist – PIRS

Annex 4

7th Public Health Planning for Hearing Impairment online course Islamabad 6-9th December 2021

Monday	Topic	Facilitator(s)
0900 – 0915	Opening of the course – Programme Zoom/Meeting guidelines	Dr Aliya Qadir
0915 – 0930	Welcome address	Dr Farrukh Seir
0930 – 1000	Introducing each other	Everyone
1000 – 1015	Introduction to the course: learning objectives and teaching and learning methods	Prof Andrew Smith
1015 – 1045	Definition and Magnitude of hearing loss	Prof Andrew Smith
1045 – 1100	Exercise 2 on calculating rates and numbers.	Prof Andrew Smith
1100–1130	BREAK	
1130–1200	CHEF and Hearing Health Services Replaced by a video on “Public Health”	Sohail Ayaz Khan CEO CHEF
1200–1245	Principles of Public Health applied to Hearing Impairment	Prof Andrew Smith
1245–1300	Prevention of hearing loss and introduction to exercise 3 on prevention.	Prof Andrew Smith
1300–1400	LUNCH BREAK	
	Prof Andrew Smith joins live from London	
1400–1415	Raising awareness – Introduction to hearing awareness practical. Discussion on Tuesday afternoon.	Dr Ian Makenzie
1415–1500	Continue exercise 3 for 15 minutes on prevention of hearing loss followed by 30 minutes discussion.	Prof Andrew Smith
1500-1515	BREAK	
1515-1545	Programme planning: Principles of Programme Planning & situation analysis: Where are we now and where do we need to get to?	Prof Andrew Smith
1600–1730	Group work – Selection of population and carrying out Situation Analysis	Prof Andrew Smith

Tuesday	Topic	Facilitator(s)
0900—0930	Recap of the previous day	Dr Aliya Qadir
0930—1000	1. Key intervention: Primary ear and hearing care Philosophy, History and Use in Pakistan of PEHC training resource	Prof Andrew Smith
1000-1030	Global Programmes	Prof Andrew Smith
1030 – 1100	Experiences sharing from Ear and Hearing Care	Dr Manzoor ENT Specialist
1100-1130	BREAK	
1130-1215	2) Development of Primary ear and hearing care training Resource as a training tool 3) Implementing Primary, secondary, and tertiary ear and hearing care	Dr Diego Santana
1215-1315	Developing a District Programme – Bolivia	Dr Diego Santana
1315-1345	LUNCH BREAK	
1345	Prof Andrew Smith joins live from London	
1345-1400	Advocacy for EHC	Dr Aliya Qadir
1400-1430	Introduction to education for deaf and hard of hearing children	Ms Sian Tesni
1430 – 1500	Planning: setting aim, objectives, identifying priorities	Prof Andrew Smith
1500-1515	BREAK	
1515 – 1530	Discussion on raising awareness exercise.	Dr Ian Makenzie
1530 – 1545	Questions on group work and situation analysis from Day 1.	Prof Andrew Smith & everyone
1545–1730	Group Work -Setting objectives, identifying priorities and activities.	Everyone

Wednesday	Topic	Facilitator(s)
0900--0915	Recap of the Previous Day	Dr Aliya Qadir
0915--1000	Overview of study designs	Prof Andrew Smith
1000—1045	Assistive Technology Discussion	Dr. Maryam Mallick – WHO Pakistan
1045—1115	Monitoring and evaluation: developing indicators, targets & budgets	Prof Andrew Smith
1115--1130	BREAK	
1130-1150	Consanguinity and hearing loss/NIHL	Dr Ian Makenzie
1150	Prof Andrew Smith joins live from London	
1150-1200	Introduction of Dr Shelly Chadha – WHO	Prof Andrew Smith
1200—1230	WHO Programme on Prevention of Hearing Loss	Dr Shelly Chadha (by zoom link) – WHO Geneva
1230 - 1245	World Report on Hearing	Dr Shelly Chadha (by zoom link) – WHO Geneva
1245-1250	A short video “Hidden Disability”	
1250 - 1300	Q & A – Discussion	Everyone
1300--1400	LUNCH BREAK	
1400--1430	Burden of Otitis Media	Dr Robin Youngs – ICED/LSHTM
1430--1500	Community hearing outreach programme	Dr Syed Sajjad Ahmed – Consultant Audiologist Shifa International Islamabad
1500--1515	BREAK	
1515--1730	Group work – programme plans for selected population – setting timeframe, monitoring and evaluation	Prof Andrew Smith & everyone

Thursday	Topic	Facilitator(s)
0900 –0915	Recap of previous day	Dr Aliya Qadir
0915--0945	How to survey for hearing impairment –. WHO method. (Exercise 4)	
0945–1030	WHO Principles of screening; screening at different ages	Ms Serah Ndegwa
1030–1115	Barriers to hearing aids, raising awareness - presentation & discussion.	Prof Andrew Smith
1115–1145	BREAK	
1145–1215	Hearing loss and Dementia	Dr John Newall
1215—1300	Tele-audiology	Dr John Newall
1300 –1400	LUNCH BREAK	
	Prof Andrew Smith joins via zoom from London	
1400 –1430	Rapid Assessment of Hearing Loss (RAHL)	Tess Bright
1430 –1500	Group presentation 1 – Discussion	Everyone
1500-1515	BREAK	
1515 - 1545	Group presentation 2 – Discussion	Everyone
1545—1615	Group presentation 3 - Discussion	Everyone
1615 - 16450	Course evaluation – DEAPH – Comments from participants	Ms Joanna Jeremy
1645–1700	Thank you note Course end	Dr. Farrukh Seir Prof Andrew Smith & everyone